

Problem 9: A Topological Problem

Team: Russia

Abstract

1) It was shown that for the operations int , cl we can obtain 7 distinct sets. Also this result is true for any finite dimensional space (\mathbb{R}^n).

2) one of the theorems shown that equality from the question 2 holds. And both cases offered in the condition of the second question has been studied:

1) in the case $\text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) = \emptyset$, It was proved that for finite dimensional space by using all operations we can get 6 distinct sets, and if A is bounded then we can get only five sets and for infinite dimensional space it was proved that we can get at most fourteen distinct sets

2) in the case $\text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) \neq \emptyset$, it was proved that we can get seventeen distinct sets and if A is bounded we can get fourteen sets

THEOREM 1. If B is open, then $cl(B) = cl(int(cl(B)))$.

Proof. we proved this equality by two inclusions:

$$int(cl(B)) \subseteq cl(B) \Rightarrow cl(int(cl(B))) \subseteq cl(cl(B)) = cl(B).$$

$$\begin{aligned} cl(B) \supseteq B &\Rightarrow int(cl(B)) \supseteq int(B) = B \Rightarrow \\ &\Rightarrow cl(int(cl(B))) \supseteq cl(B). \end{aligned}$$

CONSEQUENCE. For any A

$$cl(int(A)) = cl(int(cl(int(A)))).$$

THEOREM 2. If B is closed, then $int(B) = int(cl(int(B)))$.

Proof.

$$\begin{aligned} (a) \quad cl(int(B)) \supseteq int(B) &\Rightarrow \\ \Rightarrow int(cl(int(B))) \supseteq int(int(B)) &= int(B). \\ (b) \quad int(B) \subseteq B &\Rightarrow cl(int(B)) \subseteq cl(B) = B \Rightarrow \\ \Rightarrow int(cl(int(B))) &\subseteq int(B). \end{aligned}$$

CONSEQUENCE For any A

$$int(cl(A)) = int(cl(int(cl(A)))).$$

Now let's study properties of the *conv* operation.

THEOREM 3. For any A

$$cl(conv(cl(A))) = cl(conv(A)).$$

Proof. First inclusion If

$$conv(A) \subseteq conv(cl(A)),$$

then

$$cl(conv(A)) \subseteq cl(conv(cl(A))).$$

Then second inclusion: $conv(cl(A)) \subseteq cl(conv(A))$.

Let $x \in conv(cl(A))$. then $x = \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i$ for some $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n \in cl(A)$ and $t_1, t_2, \dots, t_n \in (0, 1)$ such that $t_1 + t_2 + \dots + t_n = 1$. Due to $x \in cl(conv(A))$, for any neighbourhood W of zero

$$(x + W) \cap conv(A) \neq \emptyset.$$

let's consider neighbourhood of zero W . Then exist balanced neighbourhood of zero U , such that

$$\sum_{i=1}^n U \subseteq W.$$

$x_i \in cl(A)$, thus

$$(x_i + U) \cap A \neq \emptyset.$$

let $y_i \in (x_i + U) \cap A$, and $y = \sum_{i=1}^n t_i y_i$. $y_i \in A$ then $y \in conv(A)$. But

$$\begin{aligned} y &= \sum_{i=1}^n t_i y_i \in \sum_{i=1}^n ((x_i + U) \cap A) t_i \subseteq \sum_{i=1}^n (x_i + U) t_i = \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^n x_i t_i + \sum_{i=1}^n U t_i = x + \sum_{i=1}^n U t_i \subseteq x + W \end{aligned}$$

due to balancity of U and $t_i < 1$. Thus $y \in x + W$. But $y \in \text{conv}(A)$, so

$$\text{conv}(A) \cap (x + W) \neq \emptyset$$

for any W . So $x \in \text{cl}(\text{conv}(A))$ or

$$\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A)) \subseteq \text{cl}(\text{conv}(A))$$

. It means that

$$\text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A))) \subseteq \text{cl}(\text{cl}(\text{conv}(A))) = \text{cl}(\text{conv}(A)).$$

THEOREM 4. If B convex set with not empty, interior and U is open and $B \cap U \neq \emptyset$, then exist open W such that $W \subseteq U \cap B$.

Proof. At first notice that if $x, y \in B$ and $s \in [0, 1]$, then

$$s(y - x) + x = sy + (1 - s)x \in B,$$

because B convex. Now let $x \in B \cap U$, and $y \in \text{int}(B)$. Then $y - x$ is limited \Rightarrow exist $t > 1$ such that $y - x \in t(U - x)$ ($U - x$ — neighbourhood of zero), that is $\frac{1}{t}(y - x) \in U - x$ or $\frac{1}{t}(y - x) + x \in U$. $\frac{1}{t} < 1 \Rightarrow \frac{1}{t}(y - x) + x \in B$, or (and) $\frac{1}{t}(\text{int}(B) - x) + x \subseteq B$. let $W =$

$U \cap (\frac{1}{t}(\text{int}(B) - x) + x)$ — not empty (because $\frac{1}{t}(y - x) + x \in W$) open set, with $W \subseteq U \cap B$. So W is the set which we had to find

DEFENITION. Let B be internally dense in V , if $\text{int}(B)$ dense in V , or in another words for any open U such that $U \cap V$ isn't empty $\text{int}(U \cap B)$ isn't empty too.

THEOREM 5. If B — convex set with notempty interior, then B internally dense in $\text{cl}(B)$.

Proof. Let $U \subseteq \text{cl}(B)$ and $x \in U \subseteq \text{cl}(B)$. Then $U \cap B \neq \emptyset$. Using theorem 4, exist open $W \subseteq U \cap B$, but $W \subseteq \text{int}(B)$, that is $W \subseteq U \cap \text{int}(B)$ — what we had to prove

THEOREM 6. If B is convex and internally dense in open U , then $U \subseteq B$.

Proof. Let theorem isn't correct. So $x \in U$ and $x \notin B$. Then exist balanced neighbourhood of zero W such that $x + W \subseteq U$. Then, for any $y \in W$ such that $x + y \in B$, $x - y \notin B$ is true (in other case using convexity if $B \frac{1}{2}(x + y) + \frac{1}{2}(x - y) = x \in B$!?). B is internally dense in $U \Rightarrow$ exists $V \subseteq W$ such that $x + V \subseteq B$, but then $(x - V) \cap B = \emptyset$, that is a contradiction, because B is internally dense. So for any $x \in U \Rightarrow x \in B$.

THEOREM 7. If B — convex set with not empty interior, then $\text{int}(\text{cl}(B)) = \text{int}(B)$.

Proof. (a) $B \subseteq \text{cl}(B) \Rightarrow \text{int}(B) \subseteq \text{int}(\text{cl}(B))$

(b) Let $x \in U \subseteq \text{int}(\text{cl}(B)) \Rightarrow U \subseteq \text{cl}(B)$. Using consequence 5, B is internally dense in $\text{cl}(B) \Rightarrow B$ is internally dense in U , and using theorem 6 $U \subseteq B \Rightarrow U \subseteq \text{int}(B) \Rightarrow x \in \text{int}(B)$ — xnd.

THEOREM 8. If B — convex set with not empty interior, then $\text{cl}(\text{int}(B)) = \text{cl}(B)$.

Proof.

(a) $\text{int}(B) \subseteq B \Rightarrow \text{cl}(\text{int}(B)) \subseteq \text{cl}(B)$.

(b) Let $x \in \text{cl}(B)$. Consider neighbourhood of U . $(x + U) \cap B \neq \emptyset \Rightarrow$ then by theorem 4, exists open set $W \subseteq (x + U) \cap B$. Thus $W \subseteq \text{int}(B) \Rightarrow (x + U) \cap \text{int}(B) \neq \emptyset$ for any neighbourhood of zero $U \Rightarrow x \in \text{cl}(\text{int}(B))$.

CONSEQUENCE 9. If $\text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) \neq \emptyset$, then

$$\text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) = \text{int}(\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A))).$$

By theorem 3, $\text{cl}(\text{conv}(A)) = \text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A)))$. Using theorem 7, we achieve that

$$\begin{aligned} \text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) &= \text{int}(\text{cl}(\text{conv}(A))) = \\ &= \text{int}(\text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A)))) = \text{int}(\text{conv}(\text{cl}(A))). \end{aligned}$$

Now using all previous theorem we can study first question of the problem 9: How many distinct sets can be obtained using operations int and cl ?

It is obvious that $cl(cl(A)) = cl(A)$ and $int(int(A)) = int(A)$. So it is unnecessary to apply any of this operations in a row thus we should to apply operations int and cl in turn. By the theorems 1,2 it is unnecessary to apply more than three different operations in a row. So maximum number of sets we can obtain is 7:

$$A, cl(A), int(A), int(cl(A)), cl(int(A)), \\ cl(int(cl(A))), int(cl(int(A)))$$

And for example if $A = \{0\} \cup [1, 2) \cup (2, 3) \cup ((4, 5) \cap \mathbb{Q})$ and $X = \mathbb{R}$, then all obtained sets are distinct. So answer on the question 1 is 7

Now solve question 2 and 3 when we also can apply $conv(A)$.

of course if A is convex then $int(A)$ and $cl(A)$ are convex too. So we should use $conv$ one time in a row. At this point let's consider two cases as it was offered in the problem: $int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$ and $int(conv(A)) \neq \emptyset$.

$int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$. So $int(A) = \emptyset$, thus first operation should be cl , and then int . So can apply operation $conv$ (if it exists) only to following four sets: $A, cl(A), int(cl(A)), cl(int(cl(A)))$. let find out what we can apply after operation $conv$:

1) A -

$$conv(A), cl(conv(A)), int(cl(conv(A))), cl(int(cl(conv(A))))),$$

because $int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$.

2) $cl(A)$ -

$$conv(cl(A)), int(conv(cl(A))),$$

because $cl(conv(cl(A))) = cl(conv(A))$, and if $int(conv(cl(A))) \neq \emptyset$, then $cl(int(conv(cl(A)))) = cl(conv(cl(A))) = cl(conv(A))$.

3) Similarly for $int(cl(A))$ -

$$conv(int(cl(A))), cl(conv(int(cl(A))))),$$

4) and for $cl(int(cl(A)))$ -

$$conv(cl(int(cl(A))), int(conv(cl(int(cl(A))))).$$

Thus if $int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$, we can achieve only following 14 sets:

$$\emptyset, A, conv(A), cl(conv(A)), int(cl(conv(A))), \\ cl(A), conv(cl(A)), int(conv(cl(A))), \\ int(cl(A)), conv(int(cl(A))), cl(conv(int(cl(A))))), \\ cl(int(cl(A))), conv(cl(int(cl(A))), int(conv(cl(int(cl(A))))).$$

Due to $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ in the condition of the problem, if $int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$, then if we apply operation int anywhere then we achieve empty set

Proof: let's take n and proof that exists $X - (n - 1) - dimensional$ subspace of \mathbb{R}^n $conv(A) \subseteq X$. By the theorem from the book [1]

$$conv(A) = \bigcup_{k \leq n} \bigcup_{x_1, \dots, x_k \in A} \Delta_k(x_1, \dots, x_k), \text{ where } \Delta_k(x_1, \dots, x_{k+1}) \text{ } k - \text{ dimensional simplex}$$

$int(conv(A)) = \emptyset$ and only if $k = n$ then $int(\Delta_k) \neq \emptyset$. So there is no n -dimensional simplex by the points from A . Thus for any $n + 1$ points from A exists $(n - 1)$ -dimensional subspace of \mathbb{R}^n . So exist $(n - 1)$ dimensional subspace X , such that $conv(A) \subseteq X$. It's easy to notice that if $B \subseteq Y$ then $conv(B), cl(B) \subseteq Y$ if Y is space. So if $A \subseteq X$ then $conv(A), cl(A)$ are subsets of X , because subspace

is space. So their interiors will be empty sets. Thus if we consider finitely dimensional spaces then by operations $int, conv, cl$ we can obtain six sets :

$$\emptyset, A, conv(A), cl(conv(A))$$

$$cl(A), conv(cl(A)),$$

$$A = \{(x, 1) | x \in (-\infty, 0) \cup 1 \cup [2, 3] \cup (4, 5) \cup ((5, 6) \cap \mathbb{Q}) \cup (7, 8)\}$$

As you see we can get this six sets But if A is limited then we can obtain only five sets because $cl(conv(A)) = conv(cl(A))$

Proof. (two inclusions)

1) $conv(cl(A)) \subseteq cl(conv(A))$ was proved in theorem 3;

2) $cl(conv(A)) \subseteq conv(cl(A))$: $conv(A) \subseteq conv(cl(A))$, $cl(A)$ -compact set then $conv(cl(A))$ is compact set too, so it is closed. Thus $cl(conv(A)) \subseteq conv(cl(A))$

Now let's consider more interesting case: if

$$int(conv(A)) \neq \emptyset.$$

Before operation $conv$ we can apply any combination of the operations cl and int . So let's study what we can apply after the operation $conv$ to get distinct sets:

1) A –

$$conv(A), cl(conv(A)), int(conv(A)),$$

because by theorems 7,8

$$int(cl(conv(A))) = int(conv(A))$$

and

$$cl(int(conv(A))) = cl(conv(A)).$$

2) $int(A)$ –

$$conv(int(A)), cl(conv(int(A))).$$

3) $int(cl(A))$ –

$$conv(int(cl(A))), cl(conv(int(cl(A))))).$$

4) $cl(A)$ –

$$conv(cl(A)),$$

because $cl(conv(cl(A))) = cl(conv(A))$, and by the consequence 9

$$int(conv(cl(A))) = int(conv(A)).$$

5) similarly for $cl(int(A))$ and $cl(int(cl(A)))$ we get

$$conv(cl(int(A))) \text{ and } conv(cl(int(cl(A)))) \text{ respectively .}$$

6) $int(cl(int(A)))$ we get

$$\begin{aligned} conv(int(cl(int(A)))) &= int(conv(cl(int(cl(int(A)))))) = \\ &= int(conv(cl(int(A)))) = int(conv(A)). \end{aligned}$$

thus if $int(conv(A)) \neq \emptyset$ we can achieve only these distinct sets:

$$A, conv(A), cl(conv(A)), int(conv(A)),$$

$$int(A), conv(int(A)), cl(conv(int(A))),$$

$$cl(A), conv(cl(A)),$$

$$cl(int(A)), conv(cl(int(A))),$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{int}(\text{cl}(A)), \text{conv}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))), \text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A)))), \\ & \text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))), \text{conv}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A)))), \\ & \text{int}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(A))). \end{aligned}$$

Now make an example if $A \subset \mathbb{R}^2$, when all this seventeen sets are distinct

$$\begin{aligned} A_1 &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0), y \in (0, 1]\}, & A_2 &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in [1, 2), y \in (0, 1]\}, \\ A_3 &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (2, 3), y \in (0, 1]\}, & A_4 &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (4, +\infty) \cap \mathbb{Q}, y \in (0, 1] \cap \mathbb{Q}\}, \\ A_5 &= \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\}, & A_6 &= \{(3, 5)\}. \end{aligned}$$

let's take $A = A_1 \cup A_2 \cup A_3 \cup A_4 \cup A_5 \cup A_6$. than

$$\begin{aligned} \text{conv}(A) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in (0, 5)\} \cup \{(3, 5)\}, \\ \text{cl}(\text{conv}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in [0, 5]\}, \\ \text{int}(\text{conv}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in (0, 5)\}, \\ \text{int}(A) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (1, 2), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (2, 3), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 < 1\}, \\ \text{conv}(\text{int}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 2), y \in (0, 4)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 3), y \in (0, 3)\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 < 1\}, \\ \text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{int}(A))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 2], y \in [0, 4]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 3], y \in [0, 3]\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\}, \\ \text{cl}(A) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 1], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in [1, 3], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in [4, +\infty), y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\} \cup \{(3, 5)\}, \\ \text{conv}(\text{cl}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in [0, 5)\} \cup \{(3, 5)\}, \\ \text{cl}(\text{inf}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in [1, 3], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\}, \\ \text{conv}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(A))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 2], y \in [0, 4)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 3], y \in [0, 3]\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\}, \\ \text{int}(\text{cl}(A)) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (1, 3), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 < 1\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (4, +\infty), y \in (0, 1)\}, \\ \text{conv}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in (0, 4)\}, \\ \text{cl}(\text{conv}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A)))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in [0, 4]\}, \\ \text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in [1, 3], y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in [4, +\infty), y \in [0, 1]\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 \leq 1\}, \\ \text{conv}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A)))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in \mathbb{R}, y \in [0, 4)\} \cup \{(2, 4)\}, \\ \text{int}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(A))) &= \{(x, y) \mid x \in (-\infty, 0), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \{(x, y) \mid x \in (1, 3), y \in (0, 1)\} \cup \\ & \cup \{(x, y) \mid (x-2)^2 + (y-3)^2 < 1\}. \end{aligned}$$

You can sure that all this sets are distinct.

It is obvious that for $n=1$ we can't formulated similar example.

If A is boardered set then as we had already proved $\text{cl}(\text{conv}(A)) = \text{conv}(\text{cl}(A))$. So we can achieve only these 14 distinct sets:

$$A, \text{conv}(A), \text{int}(\text{conv}(A)),$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{int}(A), \text{conv}(\text{int}(A)), \\ & \text{cl}(A), \text{conv}(\text{cl}(A)), \\ & \text{cl}(\text{int}(A)), \text{conv}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(A))), \\ & \text{int}(\text{cl}(A)), \text{conv}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))), \\ & \text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A))), \text{conv}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(\text{cl}(A)))), \\ & \text{int}(\text{cl}(\text{int}(A))). \end{aligned}$$

Using literature:

[1] Convex sets, Leijhtvejs, Nauka, M, 1985 (Leichtweiss, Konvexe Mengen, Springer, Berlin, 1980)